

CITY OF FRAMINGHAM

FRAMINGHAM HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

150 CONCORD STREET ▫ MEMORIAL BUILDING ▫ ROOM B-2

FRAMINGHAM, MA 01702-8325

T: 508.532.5455

Minutes of the Framingham Historic District Commission

April 7, 2020

7:30 pm, Remote Participation via Webex

Members Present: Chair Steve Greeley, Paul Charboneau, Julie Ferrari, Amy Finstein, Ted Grenham, Andrew Mackin, Ken Nowell, Paul Silva

Staff Present: Jennifer Doherty, Historic Preservation Planner

Guests: Rev. Gregory Morisse, Scott Snow

Documents:

- Agenda
- Draft minutes of March 3, 2020
- Application for Historic District Commission Review 2020-002
- Application for Historic District Commission Review 2020-003

Chair Greeley called the meeting to order at 7:32 pm.

1. Ferrari made a motion to approve the minutes of March 3, 2020; Silva second.

Roll call vote, 5-0-2 in favor (Finstein arrived after the vote)

Chair Greeley – yes

Mackin – abstain

Ferrari – yes

Nowell – yes

Silva – yes

Grenham – yes

Charboneau – abstain

2. Correspondence

Ferrari stated that after the last meeting, she had set up a meeting with applicant Bruno Trindade regarding his signage on the H. H. Richardson Depot; however the meeting was canceled due to the COVID-19 outbreak.

3. Public Hearing – Application for Historic District Commission Review 2020-002, 87 Edgell Road, Plymouth Church (Centre Common Historic District)

Chair Greeley opened the public hearing at 7:36 pm.

Rev. Morisse presented Plymouth Church's plans for a new nursery school sign. He noted that the Church has historically had a main sign and a nursery school sign, and that due to unusual lot lines, they were located on City property. Several years prior, the Church received approval from the Commission for a new main sign and a refurbished nursery school sign. After lengthy discussions with the City, the new main sign was moved back from the road onto the Church's property. They intend to do the same for the nursery school sign, but would now like a new design to match the new main sign. The two signs will be the same style and materials, and will be placed next to each other, parallel to Edgell Road in front of the Church.

There was some discussion of the size of the signs. While the nursery school sign will be shorter, the bottoms of the signs will line up.

Chair Greeley closed the public hearing at 7:44 pm.

Finstein made a motion to approve the nursery school sign as presented; Mackin second.

Roll call vote, 7-0-0 in favor

Greeley – yes

Finstein – yes

Mackin – yes

Ferrari – yes

Nowell – yes

Charboneau – yes

Grenham – yes

4. Public Hearing – Application for Historic District Commission Review 2020-003, 122 Edgell Road, (Centre Common Historic District)

Chair Greeley opened the public hearing at 7:45 pm.

Snow presented plans to replace a number of windows on his house. He noted that last year, he had appeared before the Commission for approval to replace some sunroom windows. That work was done, and he plans to use the same windows on the house. He noted that the light pattern of the house windows will be maintained, and the windows will be simulated divided lights, with a thicker muntin profile.

Ferrari noted that she and Grenham had discussed the replacement windows at the Peter and Sarah Claves House during an event there, and they had approved of the design. Mackin noted that the windows at the Claves House are aluminum clad, while the windows Snow is proposing are vinyl clad.

Chair Greeley asked why Snow was only planning to replace some of the windows at this time. Snow stated that it was mostly a cost issue, that he anticipated replacing the other windows at a later date.

Finstein noted that the house's windows have a very robust molding; she asked if that would be maintained with the replacement windows. Snow stated that it would be.

Mackin expressed concern about setting a precedent in approving vinyl windows in the district. He noted other cases where the Commission had disapproved vinyl windows. Doherty noted that each case is individual, and it is up to the Commission to decide what they believe is appropriate for each property and the district. Finstein stated that she wanted to support and encourage stewardship of historic houses, but that she was also unsure about approving vinyl windows.

Snow noted that he looked for windows that offered white as an option, because the trim on the house is white. Doherty noted that one of the major issues with vinyl windows is their stark appearance, which is minimized somewhat in the present case as the trim is white; Ferrari agreed.

Silva stated that the windows proposed are a high quality brand, and that it is difficult to tell from the street that they are vinyl.

Chair Greeley closed the public hearing at 8:09 pm.

Silva made a motion to approve the replacement windows as presented; Grenham second.

Roll call vote, 6-1-0 in favor

Greeley – yes

Finstein – yes

Mackin – no

Ferrari – yes
Nowell – yes
Charboneau – yes
Grenham – yes

5. Violations

Doherty stated that the owner of 613 Pleasant Street recently reached out to her regarding replacement windows. He had some concerns about the size of the sash, as the lower sash of each window is smaller than the upper sash; he was concerned about code requirements regarding egress. Doherty encouraged him to do what he could to maintain the sash configuration, and also encouraged him to bring multiple window designs to the Commission, in case there were any issues. He noted that he had received the Commission's letter regarding the condition of the house, and is working to secure the building. Chair Greeley requested that Doherty invite him to the May Commission meeting to informally discuss his plans.

6. New Business

Chair Greeley nominated Finstein to the position of Vice-Chair.

Ferrari made a motion that Finstein be named Vice-Chair; Nowell second.

Roll call vote, 7-0-1 in favor

Greeley – yes

Finstein – abstain

Mackin – yes

Ferrari – yes

Nowell – yes

Charboneau – yes

Grenham – yes

Silva – yes

Commission members generally discussed the issue of replacement windows. Ferrari recently read an article on replacement windows that she will pass on. Silva noted that there are a number of companies that will repair historic wood windows. Chair Greeley noted that it is important to look at the issue from a cost standpoint as well.

Finstein noted that the house at 187 Pleasant Street is for sale. Doherty will reach out to the listing agent to confirm that they know it is in a local historic district.

Ferrari made a motion to adjourn; Finstein second.

Roll call vote, 8-0-0 in favor

Greeley – yes

Finstein – yes

Mackin – yes

Ferrari – yes

Nowell – yes

Charboneau – yes

Grenham – yes

Silva – yes

Meeting adjourned at 8:30 pm.

Minutes submitted by Jennifer Doherty, Historic Preservation Planner